

Translation

PATENT COOPERATION TREATY

PCT

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY  
(Chapter II of the Patent Cooperation Treaty)

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference <b>VJ203047PCT</b>	<b>FOR FURTHER ACTION</b>		See Form PCT/IPEA/416
International application No. <b>PCT/FR2004/001622</b>	International filing date (day/month/year) <b>25.06.2004</b>	Priority date (day/month/year) <b>26.06.2003</b>	
International Patent Classification (IPC) or national classification and IPC			
Applicant <b>SAINT-GOBAIN GLASS FRANCE</b>			

<p>1. This report is the international preliminary examination report, established by this International Preliminary Examining Authority under Article 35 and transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.</p> <p>2. This REPORT consists of a total of <u>5</u> sheets, including this cover sheet.</p> <p>3. This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, comprising:</p> <p>a. <input type="checkbox"/> (<i>sent to the applicant and to the International Bureau</i>) a total of _____ sheets, as follows:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis for this report and/or sheets containing rectifications authorized by this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions).</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> sheets which supersede earlier sheets, but which this Authority considers contain an amendment that goes beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed, as indicated in item 4 of Box No. I and the Supplemental Box.</p> <p>b. <input type="checkbox"/> (<i>sent to the International Bureau only</i>) a total of (indicate type and number of electronic carrier(s)) _____, containing a sequence listing and/or tables related thereto, in computer readable form only, as indicated in the Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing (see Section 802 of the Administrative Instructions).</p>																								
<p>4. This report contains indications relating to the following items:</p> <table> <tbody> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. I</td> <td>Basis of the report</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. II</td> <td>Priority</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. III</td> <td>Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. IV</td> <td>Lack of unity of invention</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. V</td> <td>Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. VI</td> <td>Certain documents cited</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. VII</td> <td>Certain defects in the international application</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/></td> <td>Box No. VIII</td> <td>Certain observations on the international application</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Box No. I	Basis of the report	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. II	Priority	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. III	Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. IV	Lack of unity of invention	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Box No. V	Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VI	Certain documents cited	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VII	Certain defects in the international application	<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VIII	Certain observations on the international application
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Box No. I	Basis of the report																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. II	Priority																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. III	Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. IV	Lack of unity of invention																						
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Box No. V	Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VI	Certain documents cited																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VII	Certain defects in the international application																						
<input type="checkbox"/>	Box No. VIII	Certain observations on the international application																						

Date of submission of the demand	Date of completion of this report
Name and mailing address of the IPEA/EP	Authorized officer
Facsimile No.	Telephone No.

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.

PCT/FR2004/001622

## Box No. I Basis of the report

1. With regard to the language, this report is based on the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
- This report is based on translations from the original language into the following language \_\_\_\_\_, which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of:
- international search (Rule 12.3 and 23.1(b))
  - publication of the international application (Rule 12.4)
  - international preliminary examination (Rule 55.2 and/or 55.3)
2. With regard to the elements of the international application, this report is based on (*replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report*):
- the international application as originally filed/furnished
- the description:  
pages 1-14 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
pages\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- the claims:  
nos. 1-21 \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ as amended (together with any statement) under Article 19  
nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
nos.\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- the drawings:  
sheets \_\_\_\_\_ as originally filed/furnished  
sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_  
sheets\* \_\_\_\_\_ received by this Authority on \_\_\_\_\_
- a sequence listing and/or any related table(s) – see Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing.
3.  The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:
- the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_
  - the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_
  - the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_
  - the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
  - any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
4.  This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments annexed to this report and listed below had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed, as indicated in the Supplemental Box (Rule 70.2(c)).
- the description, pages \_\_\_\_\_
  - the claims, nos. \_\_\_\_\_
  - the drawings, sheets/figs \_\_\_\_\_
  - the sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_
  - any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*): \_\_\_\_\_

\* If item 4 applies, some or all of those sheets may be marked "superseded."

## INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

International application No.

PCT/FR2004/001622

**Box No. V** **Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**

**1. Statement**

Novelty (N)	Claims <u>8, 12-14</u>	YES
	Claims <u>1-7, 9-11, 15-21</u>	NO
Inventive step (IS)	Claims <u>8, 13, 14</u>	YES
	Claims <u>12</u>	NO
Industrial applicability (IA)	Claims <u>1-21</u>	YES
	Claims _____	NO

**2. Citations and explanations (Rule 70.7)**

1. In the present report, reference is made to the following document:

D1: EP 0 646 551 A.

2. INDEPENDENT CLAIM 1

The present application does not fulfil the requirements set forth in PCT Article 33(1) because the subject matter of claim 1 does not comply with the requirement of novelty defined in PCT Article 33(2). Indeed, document D1 describes glass that is coated with a 5-layer system (the thickness of each layer, in nm, has been added between parentheses): Si<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> (35-45) / Ni or NiCr (>2) / Ag (5-12) / Ni or NiCr (>= 0.7) / Si<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> (45-55) (cf. page 6, lines 52-58).

3. DEPENDENT CLAIMS 2-7, 9-12, 15-18, 20 and 21

These claims do not contain any features which, in combination with the features of any one of the claims to which they refer, fulfil the PCT

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**

International application No.

PCT/FR2004/001622

Box No. V      **Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**  
requirements of novelty and inventive step (PCT Article 33(2) and 33(3)).

**4. INDEPENDENT CLAIM 19**

The present application does not fulfil the requirements set forth in PCT Article 33(1) because the subject matter of claim 19 does not comply with the requirement of novelty defined in PCT Article 33(2), for the following reason: D1 describes coated glass that is used as architectural glass panels (cf. page 1, lines 5-15). It follows that that D1 implicitly describes double glazing including such coated glass.

**5. DEPENDENT CLAIMS 8, 13 and 14**

The combination of features in claims 8, 13 and 14 is not found in the prior art and cannot be derived in an obvious manner therefrom, for the following reasons:

Claims 8, 13 and 14 differ from D1 in that layer (d) (the layer directly on top of the silver layer) is made of titanium.

No effects arise from such a difference (in comparison with a Ni / Ag / NiCr or NiCr / Ag / Ni stack).

It follows that the problem is that of producing

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY**

International application No.

PCT/FR2004/001622

**Box No. V      Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability;  
citations and explanations supporting such statement**

glass panels with alternative 5-layer stacks.

It is not obvious from D1 that it is possible to  
replace Ni or NiCr with titanium.